

Message

From: Sasser, Erika [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=477638FE84004800BFD8E62FE3CAFC8-ESASSER]
Sent: 10/22/2018 10:20:32 PM
To: Woods, Clint [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=bc65010f5c2e48f4bc2aa050db50d198-Woods, Clint]; Tsirigotis, Peter [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=d19c179f3ccb4fadb48e3ae85563f132-PTSIRIGO]; Koerber, Mike [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=9c513901d4fd49f9ab101a6f7a7a863e-Koerber, Mike]
Subject: RE: Revised Charge questions -- PM ISA
Flag: Flag for follow up

Thanks Clint.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Woods, Clint
Sent: Monday, October 22, 2018 6:36 AM
To: Sasser, Erika <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>; Tsirigotis, Peter <Tsirigotis.Peter@epa.gov>; Koerber, Mike <Koerber.Mike@epa.gov>
Subject: Fwd: Revised Charge questions -- PM ISA

FYI - Thanks!

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Orme-Zavaleta, Jennifer" <Orme-Zavaleta.Jennifer@epa.gov>
Date: October 22, 2018 at 4:56:57 AM EDT
To: "Woods, Clint" <woods.clint@epa.gov>
Cc: "Dunlap, David" <dunlap.david@epa.gov>
Subject: Fwd: Revised Charge questions -- PM ISA

Updated. Thanks Clint

Jennifer Orme-Zavaleta, PhD
 Principal Deputy Assistant Administrator for Science
 Office of Research and Development
 US EPA
 Cell 919-699-1564
 DC 202-564-6620
 RTP 919-541-2283

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Vandenberg, John" <Vandenberg.John@epa.gov>
Date: October 22, 2018 at 1:25:06 AM EDT
To: "Orme-Zavaleta, Jennifer" <Orme-Zavaleta.Jennifer@epa.gov>
Cc: "Bahadori, Tina" <Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov>, "Dunlap, David"

<dunlap.david@epa.gov>, "Rodan, Bruce" <rodan.bruce@epa.gov>

Subject: Revised Charge questions -- PM ISA

Jennifer,

Attached is a revised draft Charge to CASAC for review of the PM ISA.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Please let me know if you'd like to see a Track Changes version.

I would like to send the Charge to the CASAC DFO to convey to CASAC by late Tuesday. Please let me know if you have any questions or revisions, or need more time to review the revised Charge. I am traveling and will be checking email; another way to reach me is via cell phone:

Personal Matters / Ex. 6

Thank you,

John

From: Orme-Zavaleta, Jennifer
Sent: Thursday, October 18, 2018 11:27 AM
To: Bahadori, Tina <Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov>; Vandenberg, John <Vandenberg.John@epa.gov>
Cc: Dunlap, David <dunlap.david@epa.gov>; Rodan, Bruce <rodan.bruce@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Charge questions -- PM ISA

Helpful, thanks Tina

Jennifer Orme-Zavaleta, PhD
Principal Deputy Assistant Administrator for Science
Office of Research and Development
US Environmental Protection Agency
Cell 919-699-1564
DC 202-564-6620
RTP 919-541-2283

From: Bahadori, Tina
Sent: Thursday, October 18, 2018 10:58 AM
To: Orme-Zavaleta, Jennifer <Orme-Zavaleta.Jennifer@epa.gov>; Vandenberg, John <Vandenberg.John@epa.gov>
Cc: Dunlap, David <dunlap.david@epa.gov>; Rodan, Bruce <rodan.bruce@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Charge questions -- PM ISA

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

We will send a revised version to you soon.

Thanks,
Tina

From: Orme-Zavaleta, Jennifer
Sent: Thursday, October 18, 2018 10:24 AM
To: Vandenberg, John <Vandenberg.John@epa.gov>; Bahadori, Tina <Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov>
Cc: Dunlap, David <dunlap.david@epa.gov>; Rodan, Bruce <rodan.bruce@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: Charge questions -- PM ISA

See below from Clint. Send an updated charge. thanks

Jennifer Orme-Zavaleta, PhD
 Principal Deputy Assistant Administrator for Science
 Office of Research and Development
 US Environmental Protection Agency
 Cell 919-699-1564
 DC 202-564-6620
 RTP 919-541-2283

From: Woods, Clint
Sent: Thursday, October 18, 2018 9:43 AM
To: Orme-Zavaleta, Jennifer <Orme-Zavaleta.Jennifer@epa.gov>
Cc: Dunlap, David <dunlap.david@epa.gov>; Wehrum, Bill <Wehrum.Bill@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: Charge questions -- PM ISA

Jennifer,

Thanks for the chance to look at these charge questions. Realizing a version went to CASAC leadership for their response, I wanted to share a bit of feedback from conversations with OAQPS.

1. One of the overarching charge questions from the Back to Basics memo seems to have been omitted (“Do key studies, analyses, and assessments which may inform the Administrator’s decision to revise the NAAQS properly address or characterize uncertainty and causality? Are there appropriate criteria to ensure transparency in the evaluation, assessment, and characterization of key scientific evidence for this review?”). It would be good to add it in, to be consistent with the memo.

2. The supplemental questions on the ISA seem very broad, especially questions 1 and 2. Given the size of the PM ISA in particular, would it be useful to add more specific questions on some of the key chapters?

3. None of these questions appear to address the core issue of strength of evidence vs. remaining uncertainties. It would be good to get CASAC weigh in on that. We

could either adjust the first two questions, or add a stand-alone question, to be sure they address it.

Thanks again!

Clint

On Oct 12, 2018, at 12:11 PM, Orme-Zavaleta, Jennifer <Orme-Zavaleta.Jennifer@epa.gov> wrote:

Clint, to follow up on the latest, attached are the draft charge questions. Note a copy also shared w Erika. Have a good wkend!

Jennifer Orme-Zavaleta, PhD
Principal Deputy Assistant Administrator for Science
Office of Research and Development
US Environmental Protection Agency
Cell 919-699-1564
DC 202-564-6620
RTP 919-541-2283

From: Bahadori, Tina
Sent: Friday, October 12, 2018 10:47 AM
To: Orme-Zavaleta, Jennifer <Orme-Zavaleta.Jennifer@epa.gov>
Cc: Vandenberg, John <Vandenberg.John@epa.gov>; Dutton, Steven <Dutton.Steven@epa.gov>
Subject: Charge questions -- PM ISA
Importance: High

Hi Jennifer,
Please see attached the revised charge questions for the CASAC review.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,
Tina

<PM ISA Charge to CASAC unsigned 10-12-18.docx>